- Covid-19 reached peak in NY
- Actions and data we need to decide on when and how to reopen
- Reopening in stages
  April 9, 2020

Prof. Nicholas Economides

Stern School of Business, New York University
http://www.stern.nyu.edu/networks/
and NET Institute http://www.NETinst.org/
mailto:economides@stern.nyu.edu

(DRAFT, NOT FOR QUOTATION)
New York State imposed “stay home” rules on 3/22

- Impact on infections of “stay home” and social distancing rules occurs with a time lag
- Crucial variable to focus on is “new hospitalizations”
  - ICU entries and deaths are a fixed percentage of “new hospitalizations” and occur with some delay
New York has reached a peak of new hospitalizations on 4/2!

Fast increase in cases from 3/16 to 3/25 is followed by a plateau (yellow line) to 4/2, and significant decrease from 4/3 onwards

Strong evidence that the “stay home” and social distancing policy is working!
How about deaths and ICU admissions?

- Deaths and ICU admissions are lagging by a week or more to new hospitalizations.
- Since deaths are more or less a constant percentage of hospitalizations.
  - deaths in NY will decline in a week at the latest.
When should the US reopen?

- Lockdown and social distancing has reduced the number of infections, hospitalizations, and deaths.
- But closing almost all businesses has huge economic cost.
  - Some estimate cost of a two month closure to be 10% of GDP or more.
- On the other hand, reopening can increase infections.
- The crucial question is to what extent will reopening increase infections?
  - We do not yet have the data to answer this question, but there is a straightforward way to gather the necessary data.
What data do we need to decide when to reopen?

- To make the decision of when to reopen, we need three numbers:
  - (1) The percentage of people currently infected in the population
  - (2) The percentage of people in the population that have passed the disease (possibly in mild form) and are immune from infection
  - (3) The rate of infection under lockdown vs when open

- Currently, in most places in the US, tests are done only on those who come to the hospital with symptoms or had direct contact with an infected person
  - About 10%-25% tested are positive
  - But this information is not useful for the decision on when to reopen because it does not reflect the percentage of infected in the whole population
  - Some estimate that there are 9 infected people with mild or no symptoms for each one that is tested positive at a hospital
How do we find the percentage infected and percentage of immune in the population?

(1) We do a randomized test on the population to find out what percentage are currently infected

This type of test exists and only about one thousand are needed for good statistics

- If we think there are significant geographical differences, we can deploy them locally
  - For example, we can test 1,000 in each borough of NYC, similarly in LI, Westchester and further upstate, total 8,000 tests

(2) We also do a randomized test on the population to find out what percentage have antibodies and therefore have passed the disease possibly with minimal symptoms

- This test is almost ready with various versions in different stages of regulatory approval
- The same numbers of tests will be needed.
What we do once we have the two percentages?

- The number of new infections in an uncontrolled epidemic is proportional to the percentage of infected multiplied with the percentage of uninfected who are not immune.
- Calling $x = \text{percentage of infected}$, $y = \text{percentage of immune}$, we have:
  - New infections: $\Delta x = ax(1 - x - y)$
    - where $a$ is the infection rate
  - The higher the recovered percentage $y$, the fewer infections we will have
    - Some people call this “herd immunity”
What happens when we lift the lockdown?

- In a lockdown, the number of contacts is lower:
  \[ kx(1 - x - y), \quad k < 1 \]

- and the number of new infections under lockdown is also lower:
  \[ \Delta x = akx(1 - x - y), \quad k < 1 \]

- When we lift the lockdown, cases will increase by:
  \[ Z = a(1 - k)(1 - x - y) \]

- To estimate \( Z \), we need the rate of infection when open “\( a \)” and when in lockdown “\( ka \)”
How do we find the rate of infection when open “a” and when in lockdown “ka”? 

- We look at the number of cases in NY before it reached a plateau, when NY was open
  - This analysis gives us the rate of infection when open “a”

- We then look at the number of cases in NY after the plateau, when NY was in lockdown
  - This analysis gives us the rate of infection when in lockdown “ka”
Is there a smarter strategy than lifting the lockdown for all? Yes!

- Do widespread antibodies testing, find out whether each person has antibodies
- Give them a certificate on their phone
- Immediately let all who have antibodies go to work, travel, etc.
  - If anecdotal evidence is correct, 25% of people in NY already had the disease, so this would immediately allow 25% of the population to work
As time passes, continue testing, bring more people with antibodies out to work

- keep the lockdown for seniors and those with medical conditions
Conclusions

- NY cases have peaked, deaths to peak very soon
- Outlined what information we need to make the decision of when to reopen and how to collect this info
- Need widespread antibodies testing and allowing those with antibodies to go out and work
- Reopening will be in stages